

Movie Clips: Thoughtful vs Problematic Teaching

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=eL9k2pTFYrE>

This clip is from the film “Mr. Holland’s Opus” in which a music teacher named Glenn Holland is able to inspire students at a high school that does not see the value in a music education. In this specific clip, Mr. Holland works with a student named Gertrude. Due to her many failed attempts to play the clarinet she believes that she is inadequate, especially compared to her talented family members. Believing she will never succeed, Gertrude decides to quit however Mr. Holland stops her. By comparing her playing to that of an artist she loves and encouraging her to focus on her emotion rather than the notes on the page, Mr. Holland brings out the talented that had been hiding behind Gertrude’s shy exterior. The scene ends with her playing the very same solo at her graduation. Having improved as a clarinet playing and found confidence in herself. I chose this clip because it shows the value in having a teacher who realizes that “there’s a lot more to music than notes on a page.” Mr. Holland is able to see Gertrude’s potential and finds a way to help her improve rather than dismissing her on the assumption that she does not have what it takes. He found something that she enjoyed and could relate to and used it to his advantage and was fully aware of the affect that emotion would have on her playing. Mr. Holland ventured away from the elements of music when it came to Gertrude because he realized that what would help her grow as a musician was not the understanding the notes on the page. And that while he could teach her the elements he could not teach “the sunset” and that one would make her a happier person as a result.

<https://youtu.be/qMHqkRYt64>

This clip is from the fifth Harry Potter film “the Order of the Phoenix” it shows Harry and his peers on the first day of classes with their new professor, Dolores Umbridge. Rather than teaching the students spells and have them practice them within the classroom as usual,

Umbridge takes a very different approach and intends to have the students follow a strict curriculum in which they are not allowed to use magic at all. I chose this clip because I believe it depicts a teacher who is not meeting the needs of her students. She refuses to deviate outside of the norm and grants the students no room for creativity whatsoever. Students who dare to speak out against her will be punished, as Harry was and it is obvious that she is merely a puppet for the ministry and has no true compassion for her students. I believe her teaching style is similar to that of Squidward in that she follows a book which is as the authority and dictates how every student should learn. Similar to one that teaches magic, music should be a class in which students are able to express themselves and experiment with their instrument. However some classes are similar to that of Umbridge and Squidward, where the teacher acts as a dictator and the students should merely sit down and listen. This teaching style is problematic because it restricts students and can ruin something they find enjoyable. Teachers should want the best for their students however according to Umbridge, passing exams is “what school is all about.”